Moves and language expressions of conclusion section of thesis at postgraduate English education study program of Bengkulu University

Fitra Andana[1], Azwandi [2]

Universitas Bengkulu[1,2]
email: azwandi22@gmail.com[2]

Abstract - The conclusion section is a compulsory chapter of a thesis and a dissertation. A good thesis or dissertation conclusion should tell the reader what work has been done and why the issue is being taken. The conclusion section of theses in the field of English language education is a form of a summary statement of the cases investigated. The summary is expressed with certain language expressions, indicating each of the 5-move of the section. The purpose of this research was to describe moves and language expressions of conclusion sections of theses written by the postgraduate English Language Study Program students of Bengkulu University. The study employed the descriptive quantitative method. The subjects of the research were 40 theses of postgraduate students of Bengkulu University which were selected purposively. The data of the conclusion moves were examined based on the five-move model proposed by Bunton (2005), and the language features were analysed based on Morley (2014). The results show that move 3 (Practical application/implications/recommendations embedded elsewhere) and move 4 (recommendations for future research embedded elsewhere) were used by 33 authors (88%) and 35 authors (77.5%) respectively. However, the move formats of the conclusion section were widely varied, nonconforming to Bunton's model. The language expressions used in the majority of the conclusion sections have adhered to guidelines proposed by Morley (2014), but many authors tended to choose weaker language expressions to emphasize the points. This study concludes that five Move Models of the conclusion section proposed by Bunton (2014) have not been reflected markedly in most of the thesis conclusion sections written by the Postgraduate English Language Study Program students of Bengkulu University, although some moves have been written in suitable language expressions.

Keywords: language expressions; conclusion moves; scientific paper; move models

1. Introduction

Writing is a crucial skill, beside listening, speaking, and reading skills. Wallwork (2011) states that when begin writing, let us say a research paper writing, we need to have an exact clear idea of what are research goals, what are the most important findings, how to demonstrate the truth of our data, and how the findings differ from, and how the previous knowledge. In higher education, the goal of academic success depends on the ability to communicate one's ideas through writing. Beyond the university, strong writing skills are sought after in the job market regardless of the profession. However, English language learners face many challenges when learning to write in a second language beyond mastering grammatical structures and amassing a broad vocabulary (Wajdi, 2018). Theses in the conclusion section of theses in the field of English education have not been of great interest to Indonesian researchers to be researched and analysed in English.

The conclusion section of theses in the field of English education is a form of a summary statement of the cases investigated, (Arsyad, 2014, p. 198) states scientific research are mandatory for researchers because research activities cannot be considered complete before the results are disseminated to people who need them so that they can have an impact social and economic. Theses provide information to readers for specification within a scientific theoretical framework in the field of analysis of English Education research journals. As Burrow (2011) stated that thesis can be written by anyone who has something to contribute to the field, and the type of theses written will depend on the kind of information the writer wishes to share. The main purpose of the conclusion is to provide enough information for readers to be able to understand the results of the discussion developed in the theses, conclusions tend to be shorter and more diverse than introductions. Some articles may have a 'summary' or 'concluding remarks'. But student papers should generally have a final section that summarizes the arguments and makes it clear to the reader that the original question has been answered (Bailey, 2011, p. 109).

Previously, theses set of communication objectives were standardized and understood by the academic community at large**.** Farid (2007) states in addition to providing opportunities for the public to read and understand more about the ideas and results of their research, it also contributes to the development of science and technology in certain fields**.** The language feature of the theses in English is very important in providing an understanding of scientific work that can be input for students to be able to try to analyze in language features in various fields of research. Many authors confuse information they should include in their discussions with information they should place in their conclusions. One easy way to avoid this confusion is to think of conclusion as a summary of everything we've said so far. In the conclusion, remind the reader what they just read. The conclusion should restate hypothesis or research question, restate main findings, tell the readers what contribution in the research has made to the existing literature, then highlight all the study boundaries, mention future directions for research/ recommendations. The conclusion should not introduce a new argument, introduce new data, failed to enter the research question, failure to state the main result.

There have been studies about conclusion conducted by international academics such as; the studies which were done by Aslam and Mehmood (2014) that analyzed genre analysis of conclusion sections of Pakistani research articles in natural and social sciences with the findings about there is more variety of move structures in of Social Sciences than the discipline of Natural Sciences. This study may contribute an understanding of the nature of conclusions of RAs across various disciplines. Likewise, Ebadi and Zamani (2016) addressing "Move analysis of the conclusion sections of research papers in Persian and English" with the result of the analysis of the moves showed that slight differences among the moves employed and with regards to the chi-square test, no significance differences were observed between the conclusion sections of applied linguistics and civil engineering RPs regarding the moves employed as well as between Persian and English RPs. Madrunio (2012) with the title of her article "Move Sequences in Graduate Research Paper Introductions And Conclusions" with the result, it appears that graduate student-writers do find the steps necessary to establishing a strong territory and thus, the need to employ at least two steps for Move 1 (establishing territory).

Another study was also done by Jalilifar and Mehrabi (2014) from Shahid Chamran University with their title "A cross-disciplinary and cross-cultural study of directives in discussions and conclusions of research articles" they say that, the research articles in both Persian and English soft and hard science RAs seem to follow a more generic and discursive trend in the employment of directives in their discussion and conclusion sections. Vafaeimehr and Masomeh (2015) from Allameh Tabataba'I with title "A comparative analysis of interactional meta- discourse markers in the Introduction and Conclusion sections of mechanical and electrical engineering research papers", the finding of this study may render some pedagogical implications, especially for ESP academic writing practices.

Although those previous studies analyzed conclusions section, there are not many studies that research specially in the using of moves and language features used in conclusion section from postgraduate theses. Meanwhile, the study of moves format and language features used in the postgraduate theses has not been done and published before. These the reasons behind decision to take postgraduate theses of Bengkulu University for this study and conducted research in descriptive quantitative study with a title "Moves and Language Expressions of Conclusion Section of Theses at Postgraduate English Education Study Program of FKIP Bengkulu University".

Zuniga-Tonio (2023) examines the move structure and lexico-grammatical features of master's thesis abstracts at a state university. The study highlights how specific moves are used to structure

abstracts and their linguistic features. Ötügen et al (2021) review move analysis models and metadiscourse taxonomies in English for Specific Purposes (ESP). This review provides insights into various analytical frameworks for genre analysis in ESP contexts.

The investigation of rhetorical moves used to disclose fan identity in fandom scholarship, focusing on how fan identity is articulated within academic discourse was done by Raw (2020). Ishak & Hidayatullah (2022) analyses moves and first-person references in Indonesian hotel responses to positive online reviews, exploring the rhetorical strategies used in these responses.

Adel & Ghorbani Moghadam (2015) compare the moves in the conclusion sections of research articles across psychology, Persian literature, and applied linguistics, highlighting differences and similarities in move structures. Alkamillah et al (2022) study the conclusion sections in applied linguistics articles by Indonesian authors, focusing on the structural and rhetorical features of these sections.

Farneste (2017) analyzes moves in the "Conclusion" and "Conclusions" sections of applied linguistics research articles, examining how conclusions are structured and the functions they serve. Zamani & Ebadi (2016) compares the move structures in the conclusion sections of research papers written in Persian and English, providing insights into cross-linguistic differences. Can et al (2016) examine the structure of moves in research article abstracts in applied linguistics, identifying common patterns and structures used in abstracts.

Peacock (2002) explores communicative moves in the discussion section of research articles, analysing how researchers structure their discussions and present their findings. Rahayu et al (2022) investigates rhetorical moves in the background sections of EFL (English as a Foreign Language) Indonesian vocational college students' writings, highlighting how background information is framed.

2. Method

This research applied a descriptive quantitative design as (Loeb, Susan, Daniel, Sean, & Sarah, 2017, p. 1) state that Quantitative descriptive analysis characterizes the world or phenomenon by identifying patterns in data to answer questions about who, what, where, when, and to what extent, descriptive analysis is data simplification. Besides (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p. 297) state qualitative methods rely on text and image data, have unique steps in data analysis, and draw on diverse designs.

The objects of this study were 40 conclusion section of postgraduate English Deaprtment students chose randomly from population described with using purposive sampling with inclusion criterion where researcher only chose from the field of English Education.

2.1 The Corpus of the Study

The corpus of the sudy were 40 theses of postgraduate student at English Education Program University of Bengkulu, in detailed it can be seen from the following table:

Table 1 List of Theses Years

No.	Year	Number of copies
1	2017	1 : T.2
2	2018	7 : T.3, T.5, T.6, T.8, T 10. T. 15, T.40
3	2019	17 : T.1, T.4, T.9, T.11, T.13, T.14, T.16, T.18, T.20, T.22, T.24, T.26, T.27, T.28, T.32, T.34, T.39
4	2020	15 : T.7, T.12, T.17, T.19, T.21, T.23, T.25, T.29, T.30, T.31, T.33, T.35, T.36, T.37, T.38
TOTAL		40

Note: T (Thesis Number)

2.2 Instruments

The instrument to collect data about the language expressions for each move in the conclusion section was a checklist. The checklist of language expressions was designed based on the guidelines put forward by Morley (2014). Morley proposes a number of language expressions suitable to express each move of a conclusion section of a thesis or and dissertation. The checklist of Moves in conclusion section proposed by Bunton (2005).

2.3 Data analysis procedures

To collect the data of the study, the researcher chose theses were written by postgraduate students of English Department of FKIP Bengkulu University. Several steps of data collection as follow:

a. The forty theses of English postgraduate students were taken randomly from English Department Bengkulu University
b. The researcher collected the postgraduate theses from 2014-2020 and all the samples were read by the researcher.
c. The researcher printed the conclusion section of the postgraduate theses because this study just focused on in conclusion sections were written by postgraduate students of English Department Bengkulu University.
d. The conclusion sections were read carefully
e. Researcher find out the Moves format proposed by Bunton (2005) and the language features of each Moves using checklist based on Morley (2014)
f. The data were inserted to the table checklist, classified and analyzed the data.

After collecting the data, the researcher analyzed the data based on the move structure of thesis conclusion section proposed by Bunton (2005). The move structure format of thesis conclusion section outlined by Bunton consists of 5 moves based on Bunton's and the data for each move were collected by means of a checklist. The steps of data analysis were as follows:

a. The conclusion sections were read and analyzed.
b. Each move in the conclusion sections was identified and coded i.e. M1, M2, and so on.
c. The moves were grouped based on their class (M1, M2, M3, M4, and M5).
d. The occurrence of moves was counted.
e. The completeness of moves was judged and classified into categories.
f. Language features or expression were analyzed based on Morley (2014)
a. There are some procedures in conducting this research: a) Qualitative data collection (finding and selecting the theses conclusion of postgraduate student of English program for research) b) Quantitative data analysis c) preparing the documents needed 4) collecting the conclusion section from the samples d) analyzing the use of language features of data, interpreting the data e) making the report of finding f) draw the conclusion. To simply the procedure, here are stages as follows: Moves identification. It means that all moves in conclusion and suggestions are identified. This identification will apply to five model's the instrument. Furthermore, an independent rater has been assigned to analyze 20% of the total number of articles taken randomly. If there were errors and code errors occurred in the sample of articles in the training so discussion, negotiation, and clarification would been held to reach an agreement between the researcher and the co-rater. In order to measure the reliability and the accuracy of the data, Cohen's Kappa statistic has been applied. This coefficient used to know the inter-rater reliability or to what extent a co rater agrees with correct representations of measured variables which are done by the author Bunton (2005; cf. Wajdi & Asrumi, 2024). All these identified will be transferred on to checklist when the process has done.
b. Interpretation. The interpretation means a process of giving explanation and meaning based on findings from data information have been collected (the expressions in moves conclusion) beside quantitative interpretation is a process interpreting finding which include personal interpretation from author.

In addition, the interpretation also includes the act in comparing each of thesis conclusions, as (Ngulube, 2015, p. 1) state that quantitative data analysis is concerned with transforming raw data by searching, evaluating, recognizing, coding, mapping, exploring and describing patterns, the raw data, in order to interpret them and provide their underlying meaning.

3. Results and Discussion
3.1 Results
This section consists of the results of the study, comprised of the research questions about conclusion moves were found in theses at Postgraduate English Education Study Program of FKIP Bengkulu University, organizational structures format used in each move of conclusion by authors of theses at Postgraduate English Education Study Program of FKIP Bengkulu University and language features were used in the conclusion section by authors of theses at Postgraduate English Education Study Program of FKIP Bengkulu University. The results were presented in the following subsections.

Table 2 The Results of Conclusion Moves format

Moves	Conclusion Moves	Description	Frequency	%

Move 1	Introductory restatement	Restates the overall issue being researched	11	28%
Move 2	Consolidation of research space	Summarizing methods, results/findings and claims, with references to previous research	10	25%
Move 3	Practical application/ implications/ recommendations embedded elsewhere	Concerns real-world uses for the research or advice for real-world situations springing from the findings	33	83%
Move 4	recommendations for future research embedded elsewhere	Indicates further avenues for research.	35	88%
Move 5	Concluding restatement	Reiterated overall findings and claims.	10	25%

The following sections shows descriptive presentations of each Move format.

Move 1: as shown in table 4, only eleven authors or twenty eight percent who restated the overall issue researched it means that twenty nine authors did not use Move 1, beside introductory restatement is an action of stating something again or differently, more clearly or convincingly or a restatement of something that has been said or written is another statement repeated, usually in a slightly different words, It reminds the reader of the strength of the main argument and reaffirms the most important evidence supporting the argument and concisely restate the research problem, to give to the reader and presented all the information on the topic, as mentioned in extract below:

Extract 1: Move 1

… to describe the types of English learning strategies used by
high, medium, and low achieving students in English Learning,
and to find out whether there are any differences in the use of
English Learning Strategies among high, medium, and low
achieving students of the institution in English Learning. (2019:T.9)

Extract 1 showed that in line 1-5, Move 1 is in the word "to describe the types of English learning strategies used by high, medium, and low achieving students in English Learning and to find out whether there are any differences in the use of English Learning Strategies among high, medium, and low achieving students of the institution in English Learning …".

Based on sample thesis mentioned, the part which showed the writer restated the issue being researched or Move 1 (introductory restatement) is stated in sentence, 'to describe the types of English learning strategies used by high, medium, and low achieving students in English Learning'. In this case, the use of the sentence 'to describe the types of English learning strategies …' indicate that the writer try to restate what kind of research being researched, this statement is highlighted as Move 1 (introductory restatement).

a. Move 2: as stated in table 4, there were only 10 authors or 25 percent summarized methods, results, and claims, another thirty authors did not used Move 2, they did not summarized the results or findings whereas summarizing is an important Move because summarizing is a thought of the process of taking information from a relatively longer chapter, theory or piece of writing and creating a smaller version that includes all the main facts and points of the original version, actually consolidated of research space can help students to learn the technique of taking out the most important ideas from a text and also learn to ignore irrelevant information that is present in the text, and with these skills are capable of integrating the central ideas in a meaningful way from any theory or conceptual write-up and improve the memory abilities, and become more skilful in the process, as mentioned.

Extract 2: Move 2
All the types of English Learning Strategies classification based on
(Oxford, 1990) namely, memory, cognitive, compensation,
metacognitive, affective, and social strategy were used by high,
medium, and low achieving students at the Health Polytechnic
Ministry of Health in Bengkulu City in the "moderate" category.
(2019:T.9)

Extract 2 shown that in line 1-5 Move 2 is in the words "all the types of English Learning Strategies classification based on (Oxford, 1990) namely, memory, cognitive, compensation, metacognitive, affective, and social strategy were used by high, medium, and low achieving students at the Health Polytechnic Ministry of Health in Bengkulu City in the "moderate" category. (In line 1-5), based on the text above, key point that highlighted the description of Move 2 is expressed on 'all the types of English learning strategies classification based on (Oxford, 1990)'. This statement categorized as Move 2 where the writer try to make the summary, methods based on the previous findings.

b. Move 3 (Practical Aplication/Implications): like we've known from table 4, there were 33 authors or 83 percent from 40 theses wrote the implication of the research and only ten authors did not implicate their research, whereas Move 3 is important besides the final outcome that occurs when a particular event takes place is known as the practical implications of that event. Practical in this context relates to the real outcome of a research, while implication deals with the logical relationship between events and outcomes, example explained below:

Extract 3: Move 3

… The identification of the strategies itself <u>can be useful for the</u>
<u>teachers or lecturers in conducting the activities that should done</u>
<u>by their learners which can help them to encourage the English</u>
<u>masteries</u> as well as can be useful for the teachers or lecturers in
conducting the treatment that they should give to their learners in
order to motivate their learners and improve their learner's attitude
or mental behavior in English learning. (2019:T.9).

As shown in extract 3 line 1-4, have shown that Move 3 was in the word "can be useful for the teachers or lecturers in conducting the activities that should done by learners which can help them to encourage the English masteries …".

The part that indicated Move 3 (Practical application/implications/ recommendations embedded elsewhere) or tell how the research applied in the real world was found on sample thesis conclusion above. It was expressed through chain words "it can be useful... " . From the text shown the writer have stated the statement of the research on how the results of the research can be applied in the real world.

c. Move 4 or recommendation for future research: from the table 4 shown that there were 35 authors or 88 percent from 40 theses of postgraduate students have wrote recommendations for future research and only 5 authors did not used the recommendation for the future research, whereas this Move so important because it shows where the researchers will take their narrative further along the logict fact they have established as showed in an example below:

Extract 4: Move 4

…, the researcher <u>hopes that this research can also give</u>
<u>valuable contributions</u> to English lecturers or teachers in
designing a better syllabus of teaching English learning
strategies (English learning teaching methodology) which fits the context of today's student
needs. (2019:T9).

As mentioned in the extract 4 line 1 and 2, shows that Move 4 was in the sentence "hopes that this research can give valuable contribution …".

d. Move 5: Table 4 also shown that only 10 authors reiterated the overall findings and claims, another 30 authors did not reiterate their research, beside Move 5 is important to review the thesis which only a small part of the conclusion. Restated thesis should use new and interesting language. It shouldn't just summarize the key points of your argument, as mentioned below:

Extract 5: Move 5

<u>By copying and applying the English learning strategy, the</u>
<u>learners will able and know how to construct the changes both</u>
<u>of their mindset and point of view as well as their attitude in</u>
<u>English learning to be more positive and meaningful.</u> (2019:T.9)

As indicated in extract 5 above in line 1-4 show that Move 5 is in the word "By copying and applying the English learning strategy, the learners will able and know how to construct the changes both of their mindset and point of view as well as their attitude in English learning to be more positive and meaningful". It found that the writer have concluded and reiterated overall findings and claims into one paragraph.

Table 3 The results of Conclusion Moves frequencies patterns

Num	Patterns	F	%	Remarks
1	Complete	2	5	All Moves exist
2	Semi-Complete	14	35	M1, M2, M3, M4 exist M2, M3, M4, M5 exist M1, M3, M4, M5 exist M2, M3, M4 exist M1, M2, M3 exist M1, M3, M4 exist M3, M4, M5 exist M1, M3, M5 exist
3	Incomplete	24	60	M2, M4 exist M3, M4 exist M3, M5 exist M1, M4 exist M3, M4 exist M4 exist M3 exist
Total		40	100	

As shown in table 3, the grouping of theses formats is divided into three in general, namely complete, semi-complete, and incomplete where each is categorized into several types, this grouping aims to see how many move formats are used in the 40 theses (see appendix 3. P. 175) based on Bunton (2005), each type will be explained below.

a. Complete: from the 40 theses studied, only 2 theses or only 2 authors used the all Moves, re-explained the research problem, summarized the research method, recommended future research and concluded statements about the research results.

b. Semi-Complete: from the 40 theses studied, 2 theses or 5 percent only use Move 1, Move 2, Move 3, Move 4, this means that there is one Move missing, namely Move 5, the author does not conclude the findings that have been researched, this is in the incomplete category.

As shown in the table above, one author used Move 2, Move 3, Move 4 and Move 5, meaning that the author does not re-explain the problems that have been studied, one author or about 2.5 percent only used four moves, namely Move 1, Move 3, Move 4 and Move 5, the author only explains the problems studied, recommends for further research and only concludes the statement about the conclusions without summarizing the methods and problems studied, as shown in the table above.

As shown in the table above, one author only used Move 1, Move 2 and Move 3, the author did not explain the recommendations for further research and does not conclude the findings. From the 40 theses studied, 3 theses or 7.5 percent of the authors only used three Moves namely Move 2, Move 3, Move 4, the author did not use Move 1 and Move 5, so, the authors only summarized the method, findings and recommendations for further research**.** 2 theses or about 5 percent only used Move 1, Move 3 and Move 4, the author did not summarize the research methods and findings and did not find any conclusion statements from the research results. This pattern explains that there is one thesis that only uses three moves, namely Move 1, Move 3 and Move 5, meaning that the author only re-explains the problem of the research, research implications and recommendations for future research.

c. Incomplete: one author only used Move 2, Move 4, it mean the authors did not re-explain the problems that have been studied, recommend further research and do not conclude the findings that have been researched. 13 or about 32.5 percent only use Move 3 and Move 4, the author did not re-explain the existing problems, does not re-summarize the research methods and findings and no conclusions can be found from the research results. 2 theses or about five percent only use two Moves, namely Move 3 and Move 5, the authors only recommends further research and only concludes the statement about the conclusion, 3 theses or about 7.5 percent only use 2 moves, namely Move 3, Move 4 and Move 5, the authors only recommends for further research and only concludes the statement about the conclusion.

This pattern explains that there is one thesis that only uses Move 1 and Move 4, this means that Move 2, Move 3 and Move 5 are removed. This pattern explains that there is one thesis that only uses one Move, namely Move 3 and Move 4, meaning that the author only explains the implications of the research and recommendations for future research. This pattern explains that there were 5 theses that

only uses one Move, namely Move 4 only, this pattern explains that there is one thesis that only uses one Move, namely Move 3, meaning that the author only explains the implications of the research.

There were showing that the language expression of the conclusion section of theses that appears mostly "based on the result, it can be concluded that, the following suggestion can be made, Based on the findings enhance our discussions ..", this indicate that, the thesis writers only use the expression that is most widely used by other thesis writers or previously researcher, as descriptive presentation explained below:

Table 4 Checklist instruments of Language Expressions

Moves	Conclusion Moves	Language expressions	Remarks	
			F	**%**
Move 1	Introductory restatement	- The paper has argued that ... - The study set out to determine . - The essay has duscussed the reasons for... - The present study was designed to determine the effect of ... - The main goal of the current study was to determine...	-	-
Move 2	Consolidation of research space	- Based on the result ...	16	40
Move 3	Practical application/implications / recommendations embedded elsewhere	- It can be concluded that …	5	13
Move 4	Recommendations for future research embedded elsewhere	- The following suggestions can be made	1	3
Move 5	Concluding restatement	- These findings enhance our understanding of ….	2	5

a. Expressions used in Move 2

There were 16 authors of theses used expression, "based on the result...", whereas another expressions for this Move were available; the study has shown that; The investigation of X has shown that; It was also shown that..., beside another authors used expression such as; The result of data analysis shows that,,

Extract 1:
  "Based on the result of this study",... **(2018:T.3)**

b. Expressions used in Move 3

Only 5 authors or 13 percent used expression, " It can be concluded that... ", authors did not used expressions available such as; The evidence from this study suggests that…, The following conclusions can be drawn from the present study …, The results of this study indicate that …, The results of this research support the idea that ..., In general, therefore, it seems that …, Taken together, these results suggest that …, the others used variatif expression such as; the improvement of the... was concluded as follows… The suggestions were also mentioned in this research...

Extract 2:
  "From the findings above, it can be concluded that... **(2020:T.7)**

c. Expressions used in Move 4

There was only one author used expressions "The following suggestions can be made... ", This chapter concludes from this research and provides some recommendations for everyone who is directly connected...

Extract 3:
  "The following suggestions can be made...". **(2018:T.34)**

d. Expressions used in Move 5

There were only 2 authors used expression "these findings enhance our undesrstanding of..., the other used expression "The conclusion and suggestions were taken from research findings..", no one used expressions such as; This research extends our knowledge of …, The present study makes several noteworthy contributions to …, The present study provides additional evidence with respect to …, The

current findings add to a growing body of literature on …., The findings from this study make several contributions to the current... .
Extract 4:
  "The conclusion and suggestion were taken from..." **(2019:T.16)**

3.2 Discussion

This research aimed to describe moves in the conclusion section of postgraduate theses of Bengkulu University and the language expressions used in each move of the conclusion section. The findings were, first, the majority of conclusion section of postgraduate theses of Bengkulu University did not contain the 5-moves as proposed by Bunton (2005) ; second, there were only some conclusion sections that were written by using language expressions for each move proposed by Morley (2014).

With respect to the Moves structure format of the conclusion section proposed by Bunton (2005), the findings is clearly somewhat different from the Moves format proposed by Bunton (2005) where in writing a thesis there are five moves that must be in place so that an explanation of the research being studied, a summary of the research on the methods and results as well as suggestions for future research, can make the reader understand more about the research. The research, and indeed according to Bunton (2005), that in writing a thesis for a more perfect writing, the five Moves must be included.

The first finding shows that two most frequent Moves used by the thesis authors were Move 3 (Practical application/implications / recommendations embedded elsewhere) and Move 4 (recommendations for future research embedded elsewhere), this means that the authors have informed reading about practical aplication or implications of the research finding and have suggested aspects that need further research or studies of the five Moves proposed by Bunton (2005), the used of Moves in the conclusion chapter varies greatly, from the results of the study it can be seen that from the 40 theses studied, it was categorized;

Complete: there was only 2 authors used all of the Moves from the 40 conclusion section theses researcher examined. this can we say "complete".

Semi-Complete: it can be seen that two theses was only used Move 1, Move 2, Move 3, Move 4, this means that there is one Move missing, namely Move 5, the author does not conclude the findings that have been researched, this is in the incomplete category. The absence of this Move in ninety five percent of the postgraduate students theses implies that reading would not to recall the objectives of the studies. In other reson, reader would not know the restatement of the findings and claims as (Siahaan & Sinaga, 2020) stated that concluding sentence should wrap up the entire argument and provide guidance to the readers about what to do with the information just have given. One author uses Move 2, Move 3, Move 4 and Move 5, meaning that the author does not re-explain the problems that have been studied, this may also make the reader lack of knowledge about the research problem being raised; it is stated that only one of thesis or about only use four moves, namely Move 1, Move 3, Move 4 and Move 5, this may result in confusions for readers about previous research references that can be used as a reference source.

The author only used 3 Moves namely Move 2, Move 3, Move 4, this was said because the author did not use Move 1 and Move 5, only summarized the method, findings and recommendations for further research. This may result in a lack of knowledge for readers about what issues are raised in the study and no recommendations for other researchers to continue in the same case.

One author only uses Move 1, Move 2 and Move 3, the author does not explain the recommendations for further research and does not conclude the findings. It mentioned that 2 theses or about 5 percent only used Move 1, Move 3 and Move 4, the author did not summarize the research methods and findings and did not find any conclusion statements from the research results ambiguity to the reader about the use of the method, the results of where associated with previous research. In other word, reader would need more time to connect to the aims of the studies as stated by Yang and Allison (2003) that summarizing the study is the most frequent element, and it is sometimes reiterated but they said too that the discussion section can cross over to the conclusion section in terms of "summarizing the study", this is because their study was about research articles. Move 3, Move 4, and Move 5 are used and it is explained that only one thesis that only uses three moves, namely Move 1, Move 3 and Move 5, without including Move 2 and Move 4, readers will not understand the findings of the research that has been done.

Incomplete: mentioned twelves author or about thirty percent only use Move 3, and Move 4, the author did not re-explain the existing problems, did not re-summarize the research methods and findings,

That indicated one author only used Move 2, Move 4, it means that the author did not re-explain the problems that have been studied, recommend further research and did not conclude the findings that have been researched, considering that all moves in the conclusions are very important to make.

Two theses or about five percent only use two Moves, namely Move 3 and Move 5, the author only recommends further research and only concludes the statement about the conclusion, this might make the reader more confused about the content of the research conducted, while It stated that one thesis that only uses Move 1 and Move 4. It means that Move 2, Move 3 and Move 5 are removed.

Then only Move 4 used, where Move 1, Move 2, Move 3 and Move 5 are important, of course the reader will not understand about the research carried out, it stated that the author only uses Move 3, namely explaining the implications of the research. This can have a very big impact because Move 1, Move 2, Move 4 and Move 5 in the conclusion chapter are very important in pattern 15 the author only uses Move 3 and Move 4, maybe it can cause readers to not understand the research being carried out,

The second research question in this study is language features were used in postgraduate theses, the findings is show that in accordance with previous study by David Bunton (2005), mentioned a few of the concluding chapters did not fit to this pattern. They only focused more on the field as a whole than on the thesis It Self, adopting a problem solution text structure, although they have an argument structure. This is probably because lack of differentiation in writing thesis guide books between discussion and conclusions and many variations used by thesis author. (Brown, 2000, p. 219) Stated that problems in language are caused by an error understanding the language and affecting factors. Different conclusion move usage might be caused by different criteria or no guide books of writing thesis applied, this can have an impact on the reader's lack of understanding of the problem under the study being research, because only two Moves are used, while all Moves are important things that cannot be separated, the goal is for the reader to fully understand the problem at hand and the solution to the problem itself.

Based on the findings obtained from the research results, there were many expressions that should be used in writing the conclusion section, it was found that most thesis writers about 40 percent or 16 authors used the expression "… based on the result, it can be concluded that…". The rest, about 13 percent or 5 authors used the expression "… can be drawn…" and only 5 percent or only 2 authors used different expression "summing up the results, it can be concluded that…", this means that the authors only refer to only one source of thesis writing, do not look for other references, this can result in no significant changes in determining the expressions used in writing the thesis, especially in the conclusion section.

4. Conclusion
This chapter describes several conclusions and some suggestions based on the findings in chapter IV in returning to the research questions posed at the beginning of this study in terms of moves format and the language expressions used in the conclusion section of postgraduate theses of faculty of teacher training Bengkulu University, it is now possible to state;

The main goal of the current study of Moves format and the language features used in postgraduate theses and the findings of this research were quite convincing and thus the study has shown that in applying language expressions used in conclusion section, only Move three (Practical implications/recommendations embedded elsewhere) and Move four (recommendations for future research embedded elsewhere) are dominant used by the author theses.

The findings of the study have a number of important implications for future practice in using different conclusion moves in thesis, the Moves formats of the conclusion section were widely varied, they were not in accordance to Bunton's model; might be caused due to many factors, one reason might be caused writers not to include all Moves; might be limited or unclear the knowledge about conclusion, it was also possible that the guidelines to write might not fulfill the specific criterion on how to write thesis conclusion, no detailed about the standard expressions used in writing the conclusion section chapter of thesis. Only two authors that using organizational structure in writing the conclusion section, it can be seen, they use all five models moves in order to make the conclusion section better and easy to understand to the reader; in using language expressions, the author only used the expressions that are the most used in thesis writing such as "it can be concluded that…, based on the result, … ",the author might be did not look for other references that can be used as a basis for reference in using expressions in the conclusion section and it could be possibly because there was no training on thesis writing guideline for study program staff.

On the basis of the promising findings presented in this paper, work on the remaining issues is continuing and will be presented in future, these findings provide the following insights for the future research recommendation where have several suggestions as follow; It could be good for the researchers especially the authors who want to write conclusion section of their thesis, dissertation, or research paper to have such a specific requirements and guidance of moves and language expressions models including the best models which compulsory to followed and find the best references sample of conclusion thesis models of moves; thesis author are suggested to follow the best standard of conclusion thesis format structure in order to produce high quality thesis author.

This study can be useful for further research for professional thesis author or another researcher who need more reference, read or write relevant topics about language features in different time; this study also can be useful for lecturer who wants to apply to the students which want to use the five models from Bunton (2005) and the thesis writing guidelines should be clearly and developed more specific.

References

Adel, S. M. R., & Ghorbani Moghadam, R. (2015). A Comparison of Moves in Conclusion Sections of Research Articles in Psychology, Persian Literature and Applied Linguistics. *Teaching English Language*, *9*(2), 167-191. doi: 10.22132/tel.2015.53729

Alkamillah, M. ., Azwandi, A., & Maisarah, I. . (2022). The conclusion sections in applied linguistics international journal articles written by Indonesian authors. *Journal of Applied Studies in Language*, *6*(2), 118–130. https://doi.org/10.31940/jasl.v6i2.543

Arief, S., Asmawi, Afrizal, Anwar, A., Derjunita, Y., Goembira, F., . . .Febriamansyah, R. (2016). Pedoman Penulisan Tesis dan Disertasi. Universitas Andalas.

Arsyad, S. (2014). Menulis artikel jurnal internasional dengan gaya retorika bahasa Inggris (Vol. 3). Halaman moeka publishing.

Aslam, I., & Mehmood, D. A. (2014). Genre Analysis of Conclusion Sections of Pakistani Research. Journal of Natural Sciences Research, 4(22), 106-112.

Bailey, S. (2011). Academic Writing: A Handbook for International Students (third ed.). Routledge.

Bailey, S. (2011). Academic Writing: A Handbook for International Students. Routledge.

Blair, L. (2016). Writing a graduate thesis or dissertation. Rotterdam, Netherlands: Sense Publisher.

Brown, H. D. (2000). Principles of language Learning and Teaching 4th edition (4th ed.).

Bunton, D. (2002). Generic moves in PhD theses introductions. In J. Flowerdew, Academic Discourse (pp. 57-75). Longman.

Bunton, D. (2005). The structure of PhD conclusion chapters. Journal of English for Academic Purposes, 4, 207-224. doi:10.1016/j.jeap.2005.03.004

Burrow, T. (2011). Writing research articles for publication. the Asian Institute of Technology Language Center.

Can S, Karabacak E, Qin J. (2016). Structure of Moves in Research Article Abstracts in Applied Linguistics. *Publications*. 4(3):23. https://doi.org/10.3390/publications4030023.

Chowdhury, F. (2019). Application of Rubrics in the Classroom: A Vital Tool for Improvement. International Education Studies, 12(1), 61-68. doi:10.5539/ies.v12n1p61

Creswell, J. w., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). Research design- Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (fifth edition). SAGE Publication, Inc.

Dong, Y. R. (1998). Non-native Graduate Students'Thesis/Dissertation Writing in Science:Self-reports by Students and TheirAdvisors from Two U.S. Institutions. English for Specific Purpose, 17(4), 369-390.

Dudovskiy, J. (n.d.). Business Research Methodology. Retrieved january 30, 2021, from BRM: https://research-methodology.net/research-methodology/suggestions-future-research/

Duke, t. (2018, May 1). How to do a postgraduate research project and write. BMJ Journals, 103(9), 103:820-827. Retrieved from http://orcid.org/0000-0003-4637-1416

Ebadi, S., & Zamani, G. (2016, March). Move Analysis of the Conclusion Sections of Research Papers in Persian and. Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 11(1), 09-20.

Farid, M. (2007). Artikel ilmiah: Proses ide hingga publikasi makalah seminar penulisan artikel ilmiah. Makalah seminar penulisan artikel ilmiah, Perhimpunan Pelajar Indonesia (PPI), 1-9.

Farneste, M. (2017). Moves in the Sections "Conclusion" and "Conclusions" in Applied Linguistics Research Articles. *Baltic Journal of English Language, Literature and Culture*, *7*, 58–73. https://doi.org/10.22364/BJELLC.07.2017.04

Halliday, M. A., & Webster, J. (2003). On language and linguistics. MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall.

Hayati, R. (2019, November 4). Pengertian Kesimpulan, Jenis, Ciri, Syarat, dan Cara Menulisnya. Retrieved from PenelitianIlmiah.com: https://penelitianilmiah.com/pengertian-kesimpulan

Hewings, M. (1993). The End! How to Conclude Dissertation. In G. Blue (Ed), Language learning and success: Studying through English. 105-112.

Hilbrich, M., Gu, K., & Kelsten, J. (2013, December 13). Concluding Paragraph 8th grade style. Retrieved from https://www.slideshare.net/julietkelsten/ebook-29193715?

https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Classroom_discourse_a_model_of_classroom.html?id=K3TYDwAAQBAJ&redir_esc=y

Ishak, C., & Hidayatullah, M. (2022). An analysis of moves and first-person references in Indonesian hotel responses to online positive reviews. *Studies in English Language and Education, 9*(3), 1221-1238. doi:https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v9i3.25038.

Jalilifar, A., & Mehrabi, K. (2014, January). A cross-disciplinary and cross-cultural study of directives. Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research, 2(1), 27-44.

Kabir, S. S. (2016). Basic Guidelines for Research: An Introductory Approach for All Disciplines. Book Zone Publication.

Kember, D., & Corbett, M. (2018). Structuring the thesis, matching method, paradigm, theories and findings. Springer Nature Singaporen Pte Ltd. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-0511-5

Leeds, U. o. (2021). Skills@Library. Retrieved from https://library.leeds.ac.uk/info/14011/writing/106/academic_writing

Livingston, S. A. (2012). How to Write an Effective Research Report. (J. Carlson, Ed.) Educational Testing Service (ETS).

Loeb, S., Susan, D., Daniel, M., Sean, R., & Sarah, R. (2017). Descriptive analysis in education: A guide for researchers. NCEE.

M, D. W., & J, B. T. (2011). Study Skills for International Postgraduate Students. Giblin Eunson Library.

Madrunio, M. (2012, March). Move Sequences In Graduate Research Paper Introductions And Conclusions. (J. Winston, Ed.) i-manager's Journal on English Language Teaching, 2(1), 1-62. doi:DOI: 10.26634/jelt.2.1.1615

Majeed, F. A. (2017, March). The Lists in The Attached File Offer General Phrases that can be used to Enhance your Scientific Writing. ResearchGate, 1-9. doi:10.13140/RG.2.2.13376.12805

McCombes, S. (2020, October 13). Scribbr. Retrieved February 20, 2021, from How To Write Conclusions: https://www.scribbr.com/dissertation/write-conclusion/

Morley, D. J. (2014). Academic Phrasebank. The University of Manchester.

Neisi, H., & Gorjian, B. (2017). A Comparative Study of Using References in English. Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Learning, 3(4), 79-87. doi:10.5923/j.jalll.20170304.01

Ng, J. (2019, 04 11). Assignment Help. Retrieved January 30, 2021, from Important Language Features You Should Know: https://www.totalassignmenthelp.com/blog/language-features/

Ngulube, P. (2015, June). Qualitative data analysis and interpretation: Systematic search for meaning. ResearchGate, 1-20. doi:10.13140/RG.2.1.1375.7608

Nwogu, K. N. (1997). The Medical Research Paper: Structure and Functions. English for Specific Purpose, 16(2), 119-138.

Oleo, U. H. (2019). Panduan penulisan tesis dan disertasi. kendari.

Ötügen, R., Takkaç, M., & Yağız, O. (2021). Genre analysis in ESP: A review of move analysis models and metadiscourse taxonomies. E-Kafkas Journal of Educational Research, 8(1), 67-85. https://doi.org/10.30900/kafkasegt.877595.

Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2013, November). Purposeful Sampling for Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis. Adm Policy Ment Health, 42(5). doi:10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y

Paltridge, B. (2002). Thesis and dissertation writing. English for Specific Purposes, 125-143.

Pardede, P. (2018). Research Components. 28-45.

Peacock, M. (2002). Communicative moves in the discussion section of research articles. System, Volume 30, Issue 4, Pages 479-497.

Putri, A., Ermanto, & Tahar, H. E. (2018). Grammatical Cohession on Collected Thesis. International Conference on Language, Literature, and Education (ICLLE). 263, pp. 1-6. Atlantis Press.

Rahayu, T., Permatasari, I., Mudofir, I., Sutantohadi, A., & Maftuh, M. (2022). Rhetorical Moves In The Background Sections Of Efl Indonesian Vocational College Students. *LLT Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Teaching, 25*(2), 660-670. doi:https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v25i2.4273

Raw, A.E. (2020). Rhetorical moves in disclosing fan identity in fandom scholarship. *Transformative Works and Cultures*, Vol 33.

Samuels, P. (2020, April). A Really Simple Guide to Quantitative Data Analysis. Researchgate, 1-6. doi:10.13140/RG.2.2.25915.36645

Sepni, L. (2016). Analisis struktur retorika dan fitur linguistik bagian p-endahuluan artikel jurnal penelitian berbahasa Indonesia dalam bidang ilmu kedokteran dan kesehatan. Diksa, 2(1), 43-53.

Shaw, P. (n.d.). Writing course. University of Newcastle Upon Tyne.

Siahaan, M. M., & Sinaga, A. R. (2020). Writing English essay. (B. L. Siahaan, Ed.) FP. Aswaja.

Swales, J. M. (1990). Genre analysis: English in Academic and Research Settings. Cambridge University Press.

Swales, J. M., & Feak, C. B. (1994). Academic Writing for. The University of Michigan Press.

Tajeddin, Z., & Rahimi, A. (2017, January). A Conversation Analysis of Ellipsis and Substitution in Global. International Journal of Society, Culture and Language (IJSCL), 5(1), 1-14.

Vafaeimehr, R., & Masoomeh, E. (2015, January). A comparative analysis of interactional metadiscourse. Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research, 3(1), 37-56.

Wajdi, M. (2018). Classroom Discourse: A Model of Language Classroom Research. Surabaya: CV. Jakad Publishing.

Wajdi, M., & Asrumi, A. (2024). Analysing the slogan "LUBER" in Indonesia's 2024 general election: A critical discourse analysis. Journal of Language and Pragmatics Studies, 3(1), 53–65. https://doi.org/10.58881/jlps.v3i1.39

Wallwork, A. (2011). English for writing research papers. Springer Science.

Wolf, K., & Stevens, E. (2007). The Role of Rubrics in Advancing and Assessing Student Learning. The Journal of Effective Teaching (JET), 7(1), 3-14.

Yang, R., & Allison, D. (2003). Research articles in applied linguistics: moving from results to conclusions. English for Specific Purposes, 365-385.doi:10.1016/S0889-4906(02)00026-1

Yeganeh, M. T., & Boghayeri, M. (2015, December 11-13). The frequency and function of reporting verbs in research written by Native Persian and English speakers. LINELT-2014. 192, pp. 1-582. Elsevier Ltd. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.06.097

Zamani, G., & Ebadi, S. (2016). Move Analysis of the Conclusion Sections of Research Papers in Persian and English. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 11*, 9-20.

Zemach, D. E., & Rumisek, L. A. (2005). Academic writing: from paragraph to essay. Macmillan Publishers Limited.

Zuniga-Tonio, J. (2023). Move Structure and Lexico-Grammatical Features of Master's Thesis Abstracts in A State University. Journal of Education, Management and Development Studies, 3(4), 48–63. https://doi.org/10.52631/jemds.v3i4.203